Copyright Cuadernos de Bioética



# AGEISM AMONG DENTISTS WHO ARE FACEBOOK USERS IN GREECE

# EDADISMO ENTRE LOS DENTISTAS QUE UTILIZAN FACEBOOK EN GRECIA

# POLYCHRONIS VOULTSOS<sup>1\*</sup>, DIMITRA TSIANTOU<sup>2</sup>, FOTIOS CHATZINIKOLAOU<sup>1</sup>, ANGELIKI PAPANA<sup>3</sup>, ASPASIA DELILIGKA<sup>4</sup>

- 1. Laboratory of Forensic Medicine & Toxicology (Medical Law and Ethics), School of Medicine, Faculty of Health Sciences, Aristotle University, University Campus, GR-541 24, Thessaloniki, Greece.
- 2. Paediatric Dentist-Scientific Coordinator in Mytoothland Pediatric Dental Clinic, Great Alexander Str 69, GR-562 24, Thessaloniki, Greece.
- 3. Department of Economics, School of Economics and Regional Studies, University of Macedonia, Egnatia Str 156, GR-546 36 Thessaloniki, Greece.
- 4. AHEPA University Hospital, Kiriakidi Str 1, GR-546 21Thessaloniki, Greece
- \*Corresponding Author (Autor Correspondiente):

Address: Laboratory of Forensic Medicine & Toxicology (Medical Law and Ethics), School of Medicine, Faculty of Health Sciences, Aristotle University, University Campus, Postal Code 541 24, Thessaloniki, Greece. Email: pvoultsos@auth.gr

Tel,: 0030 2310999285 / 0030 6932727580

# ABSTRACT:

# Keywords:

Ageism, Elderly/aged people, Dentists, Scale/Questionnaire, Greek/Greece

Recibido: 08/04/2022 Aceptado: 26/11/2022 The phenomenon of ageism in healthcare is a significant threat to elderly people's well-being. There is a literature gap regarding the topic of ageism among dental professionals in Greece. This study aims to contribute to filling this gap. A cross-sectional study was conducted using recently validated in Greece 15–item ageism 6-point Likert-scale. The scale has been previously validated in the environment of senior dental students. Purposive sampling was used to select participants. A total of 365 dentists responded to the questionnaire. As to the internal consistency of the scale, Cronbach's alpha found to be very low ( $\alpha$  = 0.590) to support the reliability of a total of 15 Likert-type questions (items) of the scale. However, the factor analysis resulted in three factors that achieved high reliability towards validity. The demographic comparison with these factors and single items revealed statistically significant gender differences in ageism (with males being more ageist than females), and differences related to other socio-demographic factors, which however, were related to factors or items individually. The study revealed that the Greek version of the ageism scale for dental students had not further validity and reliability among dentists. However, some items were distributed into three factors that presented significant validity and reliability. This is of great importance for the ongoing research on the topic "ageism in dental healthcare".

# **RESUMEN:**

Palabras clave: edadismo, ancianos/ gente mayor, dentistas, escala/ cuestionario, griego/ Grecia

El fenómeno de edadismo en la asistencia sanitaria supone una seria amenaza para el bienestar de las personas mayores. Existe un vacío respecto a la literatura sobre la cuestión de edadismo entre los profesionales de la odontología en Grecia. El presente estudio pretende colaborar a llenar dicho vacío. Se llevó a cabo un estudio transversal mediante una escala de Likert, recientemente validada en Grecia, con 6 puntos y 15 ítems relacionados con el edadismo. La escala se validó previamente en el entorno de los estudiantes de último año de Odontología. La selección de los participantes se realizó a partir de un muestreo intencional. Respondieron al cuestionario un total de 365 dentistas. En cuanto a la consistencia interna de la escala, el alfa de Cronbach resultó ser demasiado bajo ( $\alpha = 0,590$ ) para respaldar la fiabilidad del total de 15 preguntas (ítems) tipo Likert de la escala. Sin embargo, el análisis factorial dio lugar a tres factores que alcanzaron una fiabilidad alta en términos de validez. La comparación demográfica con estos factores y con los ítems individuales reveló diferencias de género estadísticamente significativas en el edadismo—los hombres discriminan por razón de edad más que las mujeres—, mientras que las diferencias relacionadas con otros factores sociodemográficos estaban relacionadas con factores o ítems individuales. El estudio reveló que la versión griega de la escala de edadismo para estudiantes de Odontología no tenía validez ni era fiable entre los dentistas. Sin embargo, algunos ítems se distribuyeron en tres factores que presentaron una validez y una fiabilidad significativas. Esto es de gran importancia para la investigación en curso sobre el tema «Edadismo en la salud bucodental».

#### 1. Introduction

The term "Age-Ism" was introduced in the year 1969 by Robert Butler (in the USA)<sup>1</sup> who described it as "prejudice by one age group against another age group", namely, thus focusing on the generation gap<sup>2,3</sup>. Ageism was defined as negative attitudes or prejudice toward older adults<sup>4</sup>. Later, the WHO<sup>5</sup> (2015) provided a broader definition. WHO defined "ageism" as "the stereotyping and discrimination against individuals or groups on the basis of their age<sup>6</sup>".

The phenomenon of ageism is a significant threat to older people's well-being, which is highly prevalent and widespread across many cultures<sup>7</sup> and may be more

importantly, that this phenomenon may be socially acceptable<sup>8</sup>. Not surprisingly, ageism is often subtle<sup>9</sup>. However, Wyman et al. put it best in saying that older adults "tend to be negatively stereotyped in the media, which leads to mistreatment, loneliness, patronising speech, discrimination in the workplace and discrimination in the healthcare systems<sup>10</sup>".

Ageism is increasing, with the increasing ageing of populations worldwide<sup>11</sup>. Cultural factors may significantly influence the ageism rates in a population<sup>12,13</sup>.

<sup>1</sup> Butler RN. Age-Ism. "Another form of bigotry". *Gerontologist.* 1969; 9: 243-246.

<sup>2</sup> Rucker R, Barlow PB, Hartshorn J, Kaufman L, Smith B, Kossioni A, Marchini L. "Development and preliminary validation of an ageism scale for dental students". *Special Care in Dentistry*. 2018;Jan;38(1):31-35

<sup>3</sup> Rucker R, Barlow PB, Bertolini Fernandes Dos Santos M, Carrera Malhao E, Kossioni A, Marchini L. "Translation and preliminary validation of an ageism scale for dental students in Brazil". *Gerodontology*. 2020;37(1):87-92

<sup>4</sup> Gilbert GH. "Ageism' in dental care delivery". The Journal of the American Dental Association. 1989 May;118(5):545-548

<sup>5</sup> WHO. "World Report on Ageing and Health". Geneva, Switzerland: World Health Organization; 2015.

<sup>6</sup> WHO. "World Report on Ageing"..." op.cit.

<sup>7</sup> Marques S, Mariano J, Mendonça J, De Tavernier W, Hess M,

Naegele L, Peixeiro F, Martins D. "Determinants of Ageism against Older Adults: A Systematic Review". *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*. 2020; 17(7):2560.

<sup>8</sup> Officer A, Schneiders ML, Wu D, Nash P, Thiyagarajan JA, Beard JR. "Valuing older people: time for a global campaign to combat ageism". *Bulletin of the World Health Organization*. 2016; 94(10): 710-710A.

<sup>9</sup> Rupp D.E., Vodanovich S.J., Crede M.. "The multidimensional nature of ageism: construct validity and group differences". *The Journal of Social Psychology* 2005; 145: 335-362.

<sup>10</sup> Wyman MF, Shiovitz-Ezra S, Bengel J. "Ageism in the Health Care System: Providers, Patients, and Systems". *Contemporary Perspectives on Ageism*. 2018: 193-212.

<sup>11</sup> Moreira AN, Rocha ES, Popoff DA, Vilaça EL, Castilho LS, de Magalhães CS. "Knowledge and attitudes of dentists regarding ageing and the elderly". *Gerodontology*. 2012; 29(2): e624-e631.

12 Wiener RC, Shockey AT, Long DL. "Dental hygiene students'

<sup>12</sup> Wiener RC, Shockey AT, Long DL. "Dental hygiene students' perceptions of older adults". *Journal of Dental Education*. 2014; 78(12): 1623-1628.

<sup>13</sup> Rucker R"Translation and preliminary validation of an ageism scale for dental students in Brazil"... op.cit.

There are differences across nations and cultures about the respect for the older adults and the value of their lives. The attitudes towards older people across different countries may be dependent on whether a country is high-income or low-income<sup>14,15</sup>. World Values Survey found that in 57 countries 60% of the older people do not receive the respect they deserve<sup>16</sup>. It has long been argued that in Europe, ageism is more common than gender or race discrimination. Note, however, that there are differences across nations in Europe<sup>17</sup>.

"Ageism is a multifaceted concept including three distinct dimensions: a cognitive (e.g., stereotypes, namely, beliefs about older people in general), an affective (e.g., prejudice) and a behavioural dimension (e.g., discrimination, namely, detrimental treatment of older people)<sup>18</sup>".

Self-directed type of ageism regards the beliefs held by older people about their own aging. It is argued that a variety of determinants contribute to other and self-directed types of ageism. Marques et al. identified a total of 14 possible determinants of ageism (13 related to other-directed ageism and only one related to self-directed ageism)<sup>19</sup>. Anxiety of ageing and fear of death are suggested to be determinants of ageism<sup>20</sup>.

As regards other-directed ageism, contact with older people seems is suggested to be the most important determinant at the interpersonal / intergroup levels (the greater the contact the lower the ageism rates), while scarcity resources in society and the percentage of older people in the country are suggested to be important determinants at the institutional/cultural levels (tensions over resource allocation in a context of increasing percentage of older adults in the population increases the ageism rates)<sup>21</sup>.

Recently, Chang et al. underscore ageism as a social determinant of health. They examined significant mediators between ageism and older persons' health drawing on stereotype embodiment theory. The authors suggest that three "distinct, yet interrelated", components of ageism (discrimination, negative stereotypes and self-directed ageism) can negatively impact health "through psychological, behavioral, and physiological pathways<sup>22</sup>".

Ageism among health professionals and students induces various "age biases" which may reflect society's negative stereotypes towards older adults<sup>23,24</sup>. Health professionals' ageism may negatively impact on the older adults' health status assessment, the treatment decisions which may be based on patient's age alone (e.g., health professionals may restrict or discourage access to care or avoid shared decision making when it comes to older patients)<sup>25,26,27,28,29</sup>. The Royal College of Physicians stated that the hospital care system "continues to treat older patients as a surprise, at best, or unwelcome, at worst<sup>30</sup>".

<sup>14</sup> WHO. [Publicación en línea]. "Discrimination and negative attitudes about ageing are bad for your health". 2016. https://www.who.int/news-room/detail/29-09-2016-discrimination-and-negative-attitudes-about-ageing-are-bad-for-your-health (Consulted 23/8/2022).

<sup>15</sup> Jecker NS. "African Conceptions of Age-Based Moral Standing: Anchoring Values to Regional Realities". *Hastings Center Report.* 2020; 50(2):35-43.

<sup>16</sup> Inglehart R., Haerpfer C., Moreno A., Welzel C., Kizilova K., Diez-Medrano J., Lagos M., Norris P., Ponarin E., Puranen B., et al., World Values Survey: Round Six - Country-Pooled Datafile Version: www.worldvaluessurvey.org/WVSDocumentationWV6.jsp. JD Systems Institute; Madrid, Spain: 2014. (Consulted 23/8/2022).

<sup>17</sup> Swift H.J., Abrams D., Marques S., Vauclair CM., Bratt C., Lima ML. "Ageism in the European Region: Finding from the European Social Survey". In: Ayalon L., Tesch-Römer C. (eds). *Contemporary Perspectives on Ageism*. Springer, 2018, vol 19, 441-459.

<sup>18</sup> Masse M, Meire P. "L'âgisme, un concept pertinent pour penser les pratiques de soins aux personnes âgées ? [Is ageism a relevant concept for health care practice in the elderly?]". Geriatr Psychol Neuropsychiatr Vieil. 2012;10(3):333-341. [in French].

<sup>19</sup> Marques S, Mariano J, Mendonça J, De Tavernier W, Hess M, Naegele L, Peixeiro F, Martins D. "Determinants of Ageism against Older Adults: A Systematic Review". ... op.cit.

<sup>20</sup> Marques S, Mariano J, Mendonça J, De Tavernier W, Hess M, Naegele L, Peixeiro F, Martins D. "Determinants of Ageism against Older Adults: A Systematic Review". ... op.cit.

<sup>21</sup> Marques S, Mariano J, Mendonça J, De Tavernier W, Hess M, Naegele L, Peixeiro F, Martins D. "Determinants of Ageism against Older Adults: A Systematic Review". ... op.cit.

<sup>22</sup> Chang ES, Kannoth S, Levy S, Wang SY, Lee JE, Levy BR. "Global reach of ageism on older persons' health: A systematic review". *PLoS One*. 2020;15(1): e0220857.

<sup>23</sup> Lovell M. "Caring for the elderly: changing perceptions and attitudes". *Journal of Vascular Nursing* 2006; 24: 22–26.

<sup>24</sup> Newton JP. "The benefits of education for the elderly and about the elderly". *Gerodontology* 2006; 23: 129- 130.

<sup>25</sup> Newton JP. "The benefits of education for the elderly and about the elderly"...op.cit..

<sup>26</sup> Bowling A. "Ageism in cardiology". *British Medical Journal*. 1999; 319: 1353-1355.

<sup>27</sup> Robb C, Cjhen H, Haley WE. "Ageism in mental health and health care: a critical review". *Journal of Clinical Geropsychology*. 2002; 8: 1-12.

<sup>28</sup> Masse M, Meire P. "L'âgisme, un concept pertinent pour penser les pratiques de soins aux personnes âgées ?"... op.cit.

<sup>29</sup> WHO. World Report on Ageing and Health...op.cit.

<sup>30</sup> Royal College of Physicians. "Hospitals on the edge? The time for action." London; September 2012. https://www.rcplondon.ac.uk/guidelines-policy/hospitals-edge-time-action. (Consulted 23/8/2022).

Dentists, by providing oral health care, make important contributions to the overall health and general well-being of older adults<sup>31</sup>. Inadequate oral health can negatively impact not only the patient's oral health, but also their general health / well-being (quality of life), especially when it comes to multi-morbid care-dependent patients<sup>32,33,34</sup>. Moreover, as in elderly people systemic health problems and polypharmacy may often affect their oral health, dentists may identify problems that disturb systemic health<sup>35</sup>. Dental needs of elders may vary considerably from one country to another<sup>36</sup>. For instance, edentulism rates (tooth loss) have decreased significantly in the last decades in Finland, Sweden, England and Canada (though not in Brazil)37. At any rate, it should be highlighted that addressing ageism is fundamental for facilitating the provision of patient-centered dental care.

Domiciliary dental care services are needed to be developed so that it can be provided oral health care for non institutionalized, disabled elderly people<sup>38</sup>. Note, however, that institutionalized care-dependent elderly people are more likely to be in need of daily oral health care than community-dwelling elderly people<sup>39</sup>. Indeed, maintaining effective oral hygiene routine for institutionalized care-dependent elderly people remains a per-

ennial problem<sup>40,41,42,43</sup>. Neglected oral health of institutionalized elders who are dependent for care is most likely to result in health complications such as pulmonary infections, aspiration pneumonia (due to dysphagia) and pneumonia-related deaths, bacterial septicemias or bacterial endocarditis<sup>44,45,46,47,48</sup>. Regular periodic oral health examinations of care-dependent elders could prevent medical emergencies<sup>49</sup>. Good oral health for institutionalized elders requires provision of routine dental health care services. However, many dentists are reluctant to visit these elderly people<sup>50</sup>. They consider this an unpleasant task<sup>51,52</sup>. Furthermore, dentists often are reluctant

<sup>31</sup> Special Committee on Aging United States Senate. "Ageism in healthcare: are our nation's seniors receiving proper oral health care?" 2003. https://www.govinfo.gov/content/pkg/CHRG-108shrg91118/html/CHRG-108shrg91118.htm. (Consulted: 23/8/2022).

<sup>32</sup> Gilbert GH. 'Ageism' in dental care delivery...op.cit.

<sup>33</sup> Hebling E, Mugayar L, Dias PV. "Geriatric dentistry: a new specialty in Brazil". *Gerodontology* 2007; 24: 177-180.

<sup>34</sup> Kandelman D, Petersen PE, Ueda H. "Oral health, general health, and quality of life in older people". *Special Care in Dentistry*. 2008; 28: 224-236.

<sup>35</sup> Waldrop DP, Fabiano JA, Nochajski TH, Zittel-Palamara KM, Davis EL, Goldberg LJ. "More than a set of teeth: assessing and enhancing dental students' perceptions of older adults". *Gerontoogy and Geriatrics Education*. 2006; 27(1):37-56.

<sup>36</sup> Moreira AN, Rocha ES, Popoff DA, Vilaça EL, Castilho LS, de Magalhães CS. "Knowledge and attitudes of dentists regarding ageing and the elderly"...op.cit.

<sup>37</sup> Moreira AN, Rocha ES, Popoff DA, Vilaça EL, Castilho LS, de Magalhães CS. "Knowledge and attitudes of dentists regarding ageing and the elderly"...op.cit.

<sup>38</sup> Fiske J. "The delivery of oral care services to elderly people living in a noninstitutionalized setting". *Journal of Public Health Dentistry* 2000; 60: 321-325.

<sup>39</sup> Wiener RC, Shockey AT, Long DL. "Dental hygiene students' perceptions of older adults"...op.cit.

<sup>40</sup> Miegel K, Wachtel T." Improving the oral health of older people in long-term residential care: a review of the literature". *International Journal of Older People Nursing*. 2009; 4: 97-113.

<sup>41</sup> De Visschere L, de Baat C, Schols JM, Deschepper E, Vanobbergen J. "Evaluation of the implementation of an 'oral hygiene protocol' in nursing homes: a 5-year longitudinal study". *Community Dentistry and Oral Epidemiology*. 2011; 39: 416-425.

<sup>42</sup> Wiener RC, Shockey AT, Long DL. "Dental hygiene students' perceptions of older adults"...op.cit.

<sup>43</sup> De Lugt-Lustig KH, Vanobbergen JN, van der Putten GJ, De Visschere LM, Schols JM, de Baat C. "Effect of oral healthcare education on knowledge, attitude and skills of care home nurses: a systematic literature review". Community Dentistry and Oral Epidemiology. 2014; 42: 88-96.

<sup>44</sup> Schmidt J, Holas M, Halvorson K, Reding M. "Videofluoroscopic evidence of aspiration predicts pneumonia and death but not dehydration following stroke". *Dysphagia*. 1994; 9: 7-11.

<sup>45</sup> Quagliarello V, Ginter S, Han L, Van Ness P, Allore H, Tinetti M. "Modifiable risk factors for nursing home-acquired pneumonia". *Clinical Infectious Diseases*. 2005; 40: 1-6.

<sup>46</sup> Abe S, Ishihara K, Adachi M, Okuda K. "Tongue-coating as risk indicator for aspiration pneumonia in edentate elderly". *Archives of Gerontology and Geriatrics*. 2008; 47: 267-275.

<sup>47</sup> Awano S, Ansai T, Takata Y, et al. "Oral health and mortality risk from pneumonia in the elderly". *Journal of Dental Research*. 2008; 87: 334-339.

<sup>48</sup> Müller F. "Oral hygiene reduces the mortality from aspiration pneumonia in frail elders". *Journal of Dental Research*. 2015; 94: 14S-16S.

<sup>49</sup> Brocklehurst P, Macey R. "Skill-mix in preventive dental practice—will it help address need in the future?" *BMC Oral Health*. 2015; 15(Suppl 1): S10.

<sup>50</sup> Grandjean ML, Morier C, Piccardi C, Srinivasan M. "Survey on the attitudes of dental hygiene students towards treating elderly patients". *International Journal of Dental Hygiene*.2021; 19(2): 176-183.

<sup>51</sup> Nicol R, Petrina Sweeney M, McHugh S, Bagg J. "Effectiveness of health care worker training on the oral health of elderly residents of nursing homes". *Community Dent Oral Epidemiol*. 2005; 33(2): 115-124.

<sup>52</sup> Forsell M, Sjögren P, Kullberg E, et al. "Attitudes and perceptions towards oral hygiene tasks among geriatric nursing home staff". *International Journal of Dental Hygiene*. 2011; 9(3): 199-203.

to treat elderly people or prefer to perform conservative dental treatments rather than mutilating procedures<sup>53,54</sup>. Note, however, that it is not certain whether this attitude is due to a lack of knowledge in geriatric dentistry or experience in managing the complex clinical problems in the field of Gerodontology, or just in ageism<sup>55,56</sup>. Studies have suggested that "older dentists make more conservative treatment decisions", which however, might be due to their better clinical judgments because of their work experience accumulated over years<sup>57</sup>. Note that it is argued that the number of young dentists in the workforce are at increase<sup>58</sup>.

At any rate, it is argued that ageism may explain why few dental practitioners dedicate at least some of their time to providing dental care for frail older adults in settings other than conventional dental offices, such as in a patient's home and in nursing homes<sup>59</sup>". It has long been argued that ageism has implications in dental care delivery<sup>60</sup>.

Neither elderly patients nor dentists may be conscious of their own ageist attitude. However, it is argued that it is important that dentists recognize these attitudes as well as their possible implications<sup>61</sup>.

Studies conducted in different places in the world found that many dentists have a low level of knowledge

about Gerodontology and suffer from a lack of training in this field of Dentistry. This may further limit the possibility of providing effective oral health care<sup>62,63,64,65</sup>. Importantly, it is argued that "ageism may explain both why fewer dentists worldwide are choosing to pursue postgraduate studies or advanced training in geriatric dentistry<sup>66</sup>".

There have been developed different scales to assess ageism in healthcare professionals<sup>67</sup>. Note, however, that a systematic review revealed a "general lack of psychometric assessments of existing ageism scales<sup>68</sup>". Moreover, the same review concluded the need for "the development and validation of a new ageism scale that covers all dimensions of ageism<sup>69</sup>".

Ageism among health professionals is a widely discussed topic. The attitudes of dentists towards the elderly people have been explored for the last 40+ years "showing modestly positive, moderate or in many cases negative attitudes"<sup>0,71,72,73,74</sup>". However, dentists' negative

<sup>53</sup> Silva MES, Magalhães CS, Ferreira EF. "Complete removable prostheses: from expectation to (dis)satisfaction". *Gerodontology* 2009; 26: 143-149.

<sup>54</sup> De Visschere L, Van Der Putten GJ, de Baat C, Schols J, Vanobbergen J. "The impact of undergraduate geriatric dental education on the attitudes of recently graduated dentists towards institutionalised elderly people". *European Journal of Dental Education*. 2009; 13(3): 154-161.

<sup>55</sup> Szabo KB, Boyd LD, LaSpina LM. "Educational preparedness to provide care for older adults in alternative practice settings: perceptions of dental hygiene practitioners". *Journal of Dental Hygiene*. 2018; 92: 16-23.

<sup>56</sup> Harbison LA, Gurenlian JR, Freudenthal J, Moffit D. "Direct access dental hygienists' perceptions concerning geriatric curriculum in entry-level dental hygiene programs". *Journal of Dental Hygiene*. 2020; 94(5): 22-29.

<sup>57</sup> Ghoneim A, Yu B, Lawrence H, Glogauer M, Shankardass K, Quiñonez C. "What influences the clinical decision-making of dentists? A cross-sectional study". *PLoS One*. 2020;15(6): e0233652.

<sup>58</sup> Vujicic M. The "de-aging" of the dentist workforce. *JADA* 2016; 147(10): 843-845.

<sup>59</sup> Cunha Junior APC, Santos MBF, Santos JFF, Marchini L. "Dentists' perceptions and barriers to provide oral care for dependent elderly at home, long-term care institutions or hospitals". Brazilian Journal of Oral Sciences 2018; 17:e18223.

<sup>60</sup> Gilbert GH. "Ageism' in dental care delivery"...op.cit.

<sup>61</sup> Gilbert GH. "Ageism' in dental care delivery"...op.cit.

<sup>62</sup> Gordon SR, Sullivan TM. "Dental treatment planning for compromised or elderly patients". *Gerodontics* 1986; 2: 217-222.

<sup>63</sup> Ettinger RL, Beck JD, Martin WE. "Treatment planning for an older adult: a pilot study". *The Iowa dental journal* 1989; 75: 31-34.

<sup>64</sup> Newton JP. "The benefits of education for the elderly and about the elderly"...op.cit.

<sup>65</sup> Grandjean ML, Morier C, Piccardi C, Srinivasan M. "Survey on the attitudes of dental hygiene students towards treating elderly patients"...op.cit.

<sup>66</sup> Marchini L, Ettinger R, Chen X, et al. "Geriatric dentistry education and context in a selection of countries in 5 continents". *Special Care in Dentistry*. 2018; 38(3): 123-132.

<sup>67</sup> Kossioni AE, Ioannidou K, Kalyva D, Marchini L, Hartshorn J, Kaufman L, Smith B, Barlow PB. "Translation and validation of the Greek version of an ageism scale for dental students". *Gerodontology* 2019; 36(3):251-257. doi: 10.1111/ger.12403.

<sup>68</sup> Ayalon L, Dolberg P, Mikulionienė S, et al. "A systematic review of existing ageism scales". *Ageing Research Reviews*. 2019; 54:100919. doi:10.1016/j.arr.2019.100919

<sup>69</sup> Ayalon L, Dolberg P, Mikulionienė S, et al. "A systematic review of existing ageism scales"...op.cit.

<sup>70</sup> Beck JD, Ettinger RL, Glenn RE, Paule CL, Holtzman JM. "Oral health status: impact on dental student attitudes toward the aged". *Gerontologist* 1979; 19: 580-584.

<sup>71</sup> Nochajski TH, Waldrop DP, Davis EL, Fabiano JA, Goldberg LJ. "Factors that influence dental students' attitudes about older adults". *Journal of Dental Education*. 2009;73(1):95-104.

<sup>72</sup> De Visschere L, Van Der Putten GJ, de Baat C, Schols J, Vanobbergen J. "The impact of undergraduate geriatric dental education on the attitudes of recently graduated dentists towards institutionalised elderly people"...op.cit.

<sup>73</sup> Ettinger RL. "Á 30-year review of a geriatric dentistry teaching programme". *Gerodontology*. 2012; 29(2): e1252-e1260.

<sup>74</sup> Moreira AN, Rocha ES, Popoff DA, Vilaça EL, Castilho LS, de Magalhães CS. "Knowledge and attitudes of dentists regarding ageing and the elderly"...op.cit.

attitudes towards older people (a vulnerable group of population) are an important issue of public health and medical ethics that remains to a large extent unexplored. Furthermore, a systematic review conducted by Ayalon et al. reveals a general lack of psychometric assessments of existing ageism scales, which moreover, fail to cover all dimensions of ageism<sup>75</sup>. The development of a universally accepted (tested in diverse populations) ageism scale that covers all dimensions of ageism, includes self-and other-regarding ageism, both positive and negative ageism, as well as explicit and implicit manifestations of ageism is desirable.

To our knowledge, there is a literature gap regarding the topic of ageism among dental professionals in Greece. We attempted to contribute to filling this gap. For the purpose of this study and in line with the WHO, people aged 60 years and older were classified as "older people" or "elderly people" or "aged people".

#### 2. Research questions

The primary research question that defined the focus of this study was as follows:

Is the Greek ageism scale for dental students (ASDS\_Gr) applicable for use in assessing dentists' attitudes towards elderly patients?

The secondary research questions were as follows:

- a) What is the current ageism score among dentists in Greece?
- b) How are the dentist ageism scores (total score and score for each item) associated with certain socio-demographics in Greece?

# 3. Method

# Procedure

In this study we attempted to further test the Greek ageism scale for dental students (ASDS\_Gr) in larger study groups consisted of dentists, as well as to provide reliable answers to the abovementioned research questions. An ageism scale for dental students (ASDS)

included 27 items (that later produced a 5-item scale that achieved high reliability towards validity) has been developed by American and European Gerodontology teaching experts that achieved high reliability towards validity<sup>76,77</sup>. Kossioni et al. conducted a preliminary validation of Greek version of the above mentioned 27-item ageism scale for dental students (ASDS Gr), administered to senior (8th- and 10th-semester) dental students in Athens, which produced a 15-item scale allocated into four factors with acceptable validity and reliability78. The scale was distributed into four factors, (considered accounted for 56.4%, of the total variance) as follows: values/ethics about older people (four items,  $\alpha = 0.71$ ), patient compliance (four items,  $\alpha$  = 0.72), barriers to dental care (four items,  $\alpha = 0.57$ ) and dentist-older patient interaction (three items,  $\alpha = 0.64$ )<sup>79</sup>.

As the Greek ageism scale for dental students (ASDS\_ Gr) has been validated in the environment of senior dental students [50], we hypothesized that in all likelihood it also might be validated in the environment of dental professionals (dentists) provided that the items of the questionnaire were not specific for students. The design of the study was cross-sectional. The study of two months duration (from 24 February 2021 to 30 April 2021) took place in Greece and a new questionnaire was conducted in Google Forms and distributed to dentists via a social media site in which any given dentist working in Greece and using social media had an equal probability of maintaining a profile or being visitor. The facebook group was widespread among the Greek dentists. Therefore, the respondents were likely to not differ from our target population. The Facebook group membership (7510 members at the time of questionnaire administration) outnumbered the 50% of our

<sup>75</sup> Ayalon L, Dolberg P, Mikulionienė S, et al. "A systematic review of existing ageism scales"...op.cit.

<sup>76</sup> Rucker R, Barlow PB, Hartshorn J, Kaufman L, Smith B, Kossioni A, Marchini . "Development and preliminary validation of an ageism scale for dental students"...op.cit.

<sup>77</sup> Rucker R, Barlow PB, Hartshorn J, Kaufman L, Smith B, Kossioni A, Marchini L. "Dual institution validation of an ageism scale for dental students". *Special Care in Dentistry*. 2019; 39(1):28-33.

<sup>78</sup> Kossioni AE, Ioannidou K, Kalyva D, Marchini L, Hartshorn J, Kaufman L, Smith B, Barlow PB. "Translation and validation of the Greek version of an ageism scale for dental students"...op.cit.

<sup>79</sup> Kossioni AE, Ioannidou K, Kalyva D, Marchini L, Hartshorn J, Kaufman L, Smith B, Barlow PB. "Translation and validation of the Greek version of an ageism scale for dental students"...op.cit.

target population (13400 dentists working in Greece according to the last census, 2019).

All questionnaires were filled anonymously and the dentists consented to fill in the questionnaire before their participation. The participants in the study were informed about the purpose of the study before written consent was obtained. The researchers informed the participants that for the purpose of this study patients aged 60 years and older were classified as older adults, and we were interested in participants' professional experience with them, no matter whether or not they were dependent patients.

#### **Participants**

We viewed the participants' profiles and got them to communicate with us in order to make sure that all participants were actually dentists that currently were practicing dentistry in Greece. The inclusion criteria for the research were participants (a) to be Greek speakers, (b) working as a dentist in Greece and (c) having experience with providing hands-on care to older patients (>60 years, dependent or independent). The sample consisted of 365 dentists from a variety of areas around the country, who finally answered the questionnaire. None of the participants was excluded because of incomplete or wrongful filling in of the questionnaire.

# The guestionnaire

The questionnaire contained two sections: the first was about demographics and the second was the Greek version of ASDS Scale. Eighteen demographic questions included age, gender, marital status, economical and job status, education and clinical practice, past and present cohabitation with elderly people, Gerodontology training, religious status and finally the number of elderly patients treated per day in their practice. The second part of the questionnaire was consisted of 15 items (Additional File-Table 1). This set of items was produced from the 27-item ASDS Scale and had previously been proved valid and reliable in Greek dental students [50]. A six-point Likert scale, with no neutral option (strongly disagree=1, disagree=2, slightly disagree=3, slightly

agree=4, agree=5, strongly agree=6), was used for answering each item.

Table 1. The fifteen questions of ASDS.

No	Question			
1*	I tend to pay more attention toward my elderly patients than my younger patients.			
2*	I tend to have more sympathy toward my elderly patients than my younger patients.			
3*	In general, elderly people contribute a lot to society.			
4	Elderly patients are better off in nursing homes.			
5*	Elderly patients tend to be more appreciative of the dental care I provide than younger patients.			
6	Elderly patients often won't accept recommended treatment plans.			
7	Elderly patients have fixed ideas about what is proper dental treatment.			
8	Elderly people do not take good care of their teeth.			
9	Elderly patients do not usually comply with dental advice.			
10	The elderly patient does not live long enough to make it worthwhile to invest time and effort in complex dental treatment.			
11	The elderly patient does not live long enough to make it worthwhile to invest money in expensive dental treatment.			
12	It is too costly to provide out of office dental care to homebound elderly patients.			
13	Cost is a major barrier to many elderly patients seeking dental care.			
14	It is normal for elderly people to have oral problems.			
15	Elderly patients should be treated by a someone with advanced training in geriatric dentistry.			
*	Reverse question			

# Statistical analysis

Descriptive statistics were used to summarize participant demographic characteristics, such as frequency distributions and percentages, while for the questions related to ageism, means and standard deviations are reported. Independence tests examined the association between the demographic characteristics, with Cramer's V correlation coefficient indicating the intensity of the association. The internal reliability of age discrimina-

tion questions was checked with Cronbach's  $\alpha$  coefficient followed by factor analysis to categorize the initial questions into a smaller number of factors that reliably measure the same mental composition. The adequacy of the sample was tested with the Kaiser-Meyer-Olkin coefficient, while Bartlett's Test of Sphericity coefficient was used to confirm that correlations between the variables allow the application of factor analysis. The existence of age discrimination based on the factors that emerged from the factor analysis was assessed cumulatively. Independent samples t-tests and Pearson's correlations were performed to investigate the discrimination between the subgroups of demographic characteristics and the factors items and the final total scores.

The statistical program SPSS 25.0 (Statistical Package for the Social Sciences) of IBM was used for the statistical processing of the results of the questionnaire.

# 4. Ethics approval and consent to participate

Written informed consent was obtained from participants. Before starting to fill out the questionnaire, each participant was given information on the study, placing great weight on the importance of maintaining confidentiality. The researchers guaranteed that the documents would be kept confidential. This study and consent procedure was approved and monitored by the Research Ethics Review Board of the School of Medicine, Faculty of Health Sciences, Aristotle University of Thessaloniki, Greece (Decision Number: 5/23.2.2021).

# 5. Results

# **Demographics**

A total of 365 out of 7510 dentists finally filled in the questionnaire in a two-month period, of whom 119 were men (32.6%) and 246 women (67.4%).

In majority, dentists were under 45 years old (39.2% aged 36-45 years and 32.6% up to 35 years), married/co-habited (65.8%) and parents (59.5%). Only 9.86% of the participants were older than 56 years. Half of them were living in the largest cities of Greece (Athens and Thessaloniki, 51.5%) and only 18.9% in a small town (<10.000)

citizens). Most of them studied in Greece (87.4%) and the average of dental practice was 15.3 years.

Four out of 5 own their own practice (78.4%) mainly men (Pearson Chi-Square=10.722, p=0.005), 13.7% reported that they were working in a dental polyclinic and only 3.3% were working in the public sector. Almost half of the participants stated that they have financial comfort (42.5%), whereas only 4.7% were in financial difficulties. Mainly they treat on average 20% of elderly patients daily (65.21%), while only 1.92% said that have more than 70% of elderly patients per day.

As to Gerodontology, only 5.8% of the sample was fully trained in postgraduate studies, 35.3% in undergraduate studies, while 32.9% had never been trained at all.

Furthermore, most of the dentists declared religious (65.8%), half of them used to live with their grandparents in the same household for a long time, but nowadays only 26% live together with elderly people, and the vast majority (79.5%) have excellent relationships with their grandparents.

Statistical analysis of the Greek version of ASDS Scale

The responses in questions Q1 - Q3, Q5 are reversed so that for all the questions the value 1 indicates the lowest age discrimination value of the participants in relation to the elderly patients and the value 6 represents the maximum one.

The response in questions Q1-Q3, Q5 were reversed so that for all questions the value 1 indicated the lowest age discrimination value of the participants in relation to the elderly patients and the value 6 represents the maximum one. The descriptive statistics (mean and standard deviation) of each item are shown in Additional File-Table 2.

As shown in Additional File-Table 2, the questions Q1, Q2 and Q13 received the highest ageism scores, while the questions Q4, Q10 and Q11 received the minimum ageism scores. That means that in general the participants do not tend to pay more attention and sympathy toward their elderly patients (Pearson's Correla-

tion  $p_{Q1-Q2}$ =0.000) and believe that cost is a major barrier to many elderly patients seeking dental care (Q13). On the contrary, they believe that elderly patients are not better in nursing homes (Q4) and they deserve to invest time, effort and money in complex and expensive dental treatment (Q10, Q11). These items were also found to be statistically correlated when compared to each other (Pearson's Correlation  $p_{Q4-Q10}$ =0.004,  $p_{Q4-Q11}$ =0.000).

Table 2. Descriptive statistics for Q1-Q15

Question	Mean	St. deviation
Q1	4.27	1.143
Q2	4.18	1.144
Q3	2.72	1.004
Q4	1.87	0.823
Q5	3.69	1.296
Q6	3.10	1.051
Q7	3.42	1.190
Q8	3.76	1.112
Q9	3.38	1.072
Q10	1.72	0.867
Q11	1.96	0.963
Q12	2.95	1.093
Q13	4.37	1.017
Q14	3.60	1.251
Q15	2.78	1.035

Cronbach's alpha is a measure of the internal consistency of the scale. Cronbach's alpha found to be very low ( $\alpha = 0.590$ ) to support the reliability of a total of 15 Lik-

ert-type questions (items) of the scale. Cronbach's  $\alpha$ >0.7 would support the reliability of the scale. Therefore, we conducted a factor analysis to distribute the items into factors (Additional File-Table 3). Based on the factor analysis and Cronbach's alpha we concluded the following three factors that met a sufficient Cronbach's alpha value: Factor 1: Adherence of the elderly patient to the instructions of the dentist (Q6-Q9), Factor 2: Dentist-elderly patient interaction (Q1, Q2, Q5), and Factor 3: Values/Ethics of dentists for elderly patients (Q10, Q11). Each factor's total score was the sum of the scores of its items and their means are shown in Additional File-Table 3.

Regarding the three factors, independent t-tests and One-Way ANOVAs were utilized to compare the total average means by subgroups of demographic characteristics. It was found that residence and the financial status of the participants were statistically significantly correlated to Factor 1. The higher ageism (p=0.002) was found among participants living in towns (14.07+-3.573) and villages (16.75+-2.659). It was found that the factor related to "Adherence of the elderly patient to the instructions of the dentist" had higher score values (more ageism) in participants who lived in towns and villages. Note, however, that this factor regards a mild manifestation of ageism. Furthermore, participants who reported to be in financial difficulties (14.705+-3.368) were found to be more ageist when compared with the Factor 1 (p=0.021) than those who were reported to be financially comfortable (13.232+-3.543). In addition, it was found that men (12.62+-3.028) presented more ageist attitudes (p=0.023) than women (11.89+-2.754) when compared

Table 3. Descriptives and Cronbach's coefficient  $\alpha$  for the three factors (reverse rating)

Factors	Items	Range	Cronbach's coefficient	Mean	St. deviation
Factor 1					
Adherence of the elderly patient to the instructions of the dentist	Q6-Q9	4-24	0.773	13.67	3.415
Factor 2	Q1 <sup>r</sup> , Q2 <sup>r</sup> , Q5 <sup>r</sup>	3-18	0.714	12.13	2.862
Dentist-elderly patient interaction	4.74-745		•		
Factor 3 Values / ethics of dentists for elderly patients	Q10, Q11	2-12	0.831	3.68	1.694

with the Factor 2. Moreover, participants aged 56 years and older (11.03+-2.903), as well as those who were living in the past with aged persons in their household (11.77+-2.82) were less ageists than the other age groups ( $p_1$ =0.026,  $p_2$ =0.020) when compared to Factor 2, also. Finally, participants working as a dentist in the public sector were found to be more ageists (5.33+-2.015) than those working in the private sector of health care when compared to the Factor 3 (p=0.025).

In addition, mean comparisons were conducted for each item of the ASDS scale by subgroups of the demographics. A qualitative interpretation of the results is attempted in respect of the information that individual items of the questionnaire carry in the context of ageism assessment.

The items Q2, Q3, Q12 and Q15 had lower mean ageism scores for women compared to men, i.e. women show more sympathy for elderly patients (Q2, p=0.008), believe that elderly people contribute a lot to society, namely, play an important role in the local society (Q3, p=0.020), deserve to invest money for an expensive dental care (Q12, p=0.005), and should be treated by a dentist who specializes in Gerodontology (Q15, p=0.0004).

Furthermore, the more the years of clinical practice, the more the dentists believe that elderly people contribute to the local society (Q3, p=0.020) and the less they think that they have fixed ideas for treatment (Q7, p= 0.001). Importantly, it was found that marital status, employment status and number of elderly patients per day were not significantly associated with any individual item. Note, however, that dentists who are parents found to believe that elderly people contribute a lot to society (Q3, p=0.020). Moreover, while the item Q6 received higher ageism scores (p=0.022) among dentists who graduated from Aristotle University of Thessaloniki, compared to those graduated from the Kapodistrian University of Athens (indicating that they believe that elderly patients do not accept recommended treatment plans), the item Q10 received lower ageism score (p =0.011) among dentists who graduated from Aristotle University of Thessaloniki compared to those graduated from the Kapodistrian University of Athens (indicating

that they believe that elderly patients deserve to invest time and effort to a treatment).

In addition, those who stated high belief in God (p=0.0210) and those who stated that currently live with elderly people in their household (p=0.039) are opposite to the assumption that elderly people live better in nursing homes (Q4). Also, those who reported that are financially comfortable believe that elderly people do take good care of their teeth (Q8, p=0.015) and that cost is not a barrier that keep elderly patients from seeking dental care (Q13, p=0.021). Notwithstanding, older dentists believe that cost is a barrier that keep elderly patients from seeking dental care (Q13, p=0.001).

Interestingly, the item Q3 received lower ageism scores among participants currently living with elderly people (p=0.019), having lived with elderly people in the past (p=0.022) or having excellent relationships with their grandparents (p=0.022), compared to other participants. That is to say that these dentists believe that elderly people contribute a lot to society.

As to Gerodontology training, it was found that those who were trained in a full curriculum (i.e. having attended a postgraduate program) have less negative attitude towards elderly patients according to the item Q7 (p=0.028) that regards the fixed ideas for proper dental treatment and believe that it is not normal for elderly people to have oral problems (Q14, p=0.000).

Interesting enough is also the fact that those working in the public sector manifest high ageism in more items. They believe that the patients do not take good care of their teeth (Q8, p= 0.039) and have oral problems (Q14, p=0.013) and do not comply with dental treatment (Q9, p=0.016). Also, they believe that elderly patients do not deserve to invest money in expensive dental treatments (Q11, p=0.000).

# 6. Discussion

The items Q8, Q9, Q10 and Q11 have already been validated in both the United States and Greece<sup>80</sup>. These

<sup>80</sup> Kossioni AE, Ioannidou K, Kalyva D, Marchini L, Hartshorn J, Kaufman L, Smith B, Barlow PB. "Translation and validation of the Greek version of an ageism scale for dental students"...op.cit.

items, as well as the factors "patient compliance" and "values/ethics about older people" in which these items are distributed, might be proved to be universally applicable if further tested across more cultures<sup>81</sup>. The development of a universally accepted (tested in diverse populations) ageism scale that covers all dimensions of ageism in the field of dentistry is desirable. A universally accepted ageism scale might include new items related to various aspects of ageism. For instance, a relevant aspect would be to assess how much or to what degree on the scale dentists see the treatment limited in dental care because of the family member or caregiver, due to age discrimination.

The findings of our study support the abovementioned assumption. Below, we discuss the findings of this study resulted from the comparison the demographics with each single factor (consisted of items) and each single item individually.

# Contact with elderly people

Importantly, participants with history of living in the past with aged persons in their household were less ageists. Having older persons in the family and history of living with older people in the same household affected the score of the item Q3 and the factor 2.

Participants currently living or having lived with elderly people as well as those having excellent relationships with their grandparents were found to believe that elderly people contribute a lot to society. Note, however, that it is not clear whether their pre-existing personal values on ageing (developed within the family environment and the local culture) contributed to developing excellent relationships with their grandparents or the excellent relationships with their grandparents contributed to the development of positive attituded towards elderly people in general. Furthermore, participants who stated that currently live with elderly people in their household were opposite to the assumption that elderly people live better in nursing homes. These

findings are conclusive and indicate positive attitudes towards elderly people among participants who were in close contact with elderly people.

Margues et al. recently state that the contact with older individuals is sufficient to reduce ageism and this is commonly accepted82. "The quality of contact with older people and the positive or negative presentation of older people to others emerged as the most robust determinants of other-directed ageism83". Spending sufficient clinical time with complicated frail older patient cases may significantly contribute to reducing ageism among dental students and make them feel confident providing treatment to elderly patients<sup>84,85</sup>. Dental students need to gain structured knowledge and experiences (e.g., through supervised rotations, dealing with the biopsychosocial concerns of elderly patients), to address their anxieties about providing care for institutionalized elderly people<sup>86,87</sup>. To reduce ageism among dental students it is necessary that their education includes exposure to care-dependent institutionalized elders with complex needs88. Dental students described positively their experiences with the elderly patients and regarded the rotations as emotionally challenging but worthwhile, enhancing their sense of professional responsibility89. Clinical rotations may help students to interact with elderly patients and gain more insights about their real-life experiences. While Veenstra et al. found no significant differences in ageism scores (among

<sup>81</sup> Kossioni AE, Ioannidou K, Kalyva D, Marchini L, Hartshorn J, Kaufman L, Smith B, Barlow PB. "Translation and validation of the Greek version of an ageism scale for dental students"...op.cit.

<sup>82</sup> Marques S, Mariano J, Mendonça J, De Tavernier W, Hess M, Naegele L, Peixeiro F, Martins D. "Determinants of Ageism against Older Adults: A Systematic Review"....op.cit.

<sup>83</sup> Marques S, Mariano J, Mendonça J, De Tavernier W, Hess M, Naegele L, Peixeiro F, Martins D. "Determinants of Ageism against Older Adults: A Systematic Review"....op.cit.

<sup>84</sup> Beck JD, Éttinger RL, Glenn RE, Paule CL, Holtzman JM. Oral health status...op.cit.

<sup>85</sup> Ettinger RL. A 30-year review of a geriatric dentistry teaching programme...op.cit.

<sup>86</sup> Fabiano JA, Waldrop DP, Nochajski TH, Davis EL, Goldberg LJ. "Understanding dental students' knowledge and perceptions of older people: toward a new model of geriatric dental education". *Journal of Dental Education*. 2005; 69(4):419-433.

<sup>87</sup> Wiener RC, Shockey AT, Long DL. "Dental hygiene students' perceptions of older adults"...op.cit.

<sup>88</sup> Grandjean ML, Morier C, Piccardi C, Srinivasan M. "Survey on the attitudes of dental hygiene students towards treating elderly patients"...op.cit.

<sup>89</sup> MacEntee MI, Pruksapong M, Wyatt CLL "Insights from students following an educational rotation through Dental Geriatrics" *Journal of Dental Education* 2005; 69: 1368-1376.

dental students) across many demographic factors, they found statistically significant lower ageism scores among students living with an older family member. The authors state that this finding can be explained by the fact that there are families that still share close bonds<sup>90</sup>. Note, however, that a study conducted by Nochajski, et al. demonstrated that students' exposure to and interactions with older adults not outside the clinic but in a clinical setting seem to have a more crucial role in shaping students' positive attitudes towards older adults<sup>91</sup>.

Note, however, that study with medical students showed that planned clinical exposures to older adults may not be sufficient to tackle the decline in positive attitudes towards elderly patients in the course of medical studies. Empathy-enhancing and social responsibility-enhancing strategies during medical studies may be promising<sup>92,93</sup>.

In Greece, despite the fact that in recent decades the traditional nuclear family structure has been changed (especially in urban areas), there are still strong bonds between the members of the same family. In Greece, Kossioni et al. <sup>94</sup> found that a total of 51.3% of the participants in their study (dental students) were currently living or had a history of living with older people in family, compared to 17.5% in the U.S<sup>95</sup>. Surprisingly, in the Greek study, history of living with older people did not affect the total scale score<sup>96</sup> similar to the U.S. study<sup>97</sup>. However, an Iranian study had previously found that

history of living with older people and being connected with them may reduce the ageism levels<sup>98</sup>.

# Socio-demographic factors:

Recently, Veenstra et al. found no significant differences in ageism scores across demographic factors such as "sex, semester of study, urban or rural background, history of living with an older person or taking a gerodontology course"<sup>99</sup>. In a similar vein Kossioni et al.<sup>100</sup> found that the total scale score was not significantly affected by demographic factors, with the exemption of individual differences in a few factors and items<sup>101</sup>. The authors state that this finding can be explained by the fact that ageism is a universal phenomenon<sup>102,103</sup>.

#### Gender

In addition, we found that men presented more ageist attitudes than women when compared with the Factor 2. More particularly, the factor related to "Dentist-elderly patient interaction" received lower score values (less ageism) in women than in men. This finding is consistent with the previous literature. Several studies have reported gender differences with men scoring significantly higher than women 104,105. This may be due to the fact that women seem to be much more empathetic

<sup>90</sup> Veenstra L, Barlow P, Kossioni A, Popescu SM, Mercut V, Tuculina MJ, Scrieciu M, Stanusi A, Marchini L. "Translation and validation of the ageism scale for dental students in Romanian". European Journal of Dental Education. 2021;25(1):12-17.

<sup>91</sup> Nochajski TH, Davis EL, Waldrop DP, Fabiano JA, Goldberg LJ. "Dental students' attitudes about older adults: do type and amount of contact make a difference?" *Journal of Dental Education*. 2011;75(10):1329-1332.

<sup>92</sup> Moreira AN, Rocha ES, Popoff DA, Vilaça EL, Castilho LS, de Magalhães CS. "Knowledge and attitudes of dentists regarding ageing and the elderly"...op.cit.

<sup>93</sup> De Biasio JC, Parkas V, Soriano RP. "Longitudinal assessment of medical student attitudes toward older people"...op.cit.

<sup>94</sup> Kossioni AE, Ioannidou K, Kalyva D, Marchini L, Hartshorn J, Kaufman L, Smith B, Barlow PB. "Translation and validation of the Greek version of an ageism scale for dental students"...op.cit.

<sup>95</sup> Rucker R, "Translation and preliminary validation of an ageism scale for dental students in Brazil"... op.cit.

<sup>96</sup> Kossioni AE, Ioannidou K, Kalyva D, Marchini L, Hartshorn J, Kaufman L, Smith B, Barlow PB. "Translation and validation of the Greek version of an ageism scale for dental students"...op.cit.

<sup>97</sup> Rucker R, "Translation and preliminary validation of an ageism scale for dental students in Brazil"... op.cit.

<sup>98</sup> Hatami B, Ahmady AE, Khoshnevisan MH, Lando HA. Senior dental student's attitudes...op.cit.

<sup>99</sup> Veenstra L, Barlow P, Kossioni A, Popescu SM, Mercut V, Tuculina MJ, Scrieciu M, Stanusi A, Marchini L. "Translation and validation of the ageism scale for dental students in Romanian"... op.cit.

<sup>100</sup> Kossioni AE, Ioannidou K, Kalyva D, Marchini L, Hartshorn J, Kaufman L, Smith B, Barlow PB. "Translation and validation of the Greek version of an ageism scale for dental students"...op.cit.

<sup>101</sup> Kossioni AE, Ioannidou K, Kalyva D, Marchini L, Hartshorn J, Kaufman L, Smith B, Barlow PB. "Translation and validation of the Greek version of an ageism scale for dental students"...op.cit.

<sup>102</sup> Kossioni AE, İoannidou K, Kalyva D, Marchini L, Hartshorn J, Kaufman L, Smith B, Barlow PB. "Translation and validation of the Greek version of an ageism scale for dental students"...op.cit.

<sup>103</sup> Veenstra L, Barlow P, Kossioni A, Popescu SM, Mercut V, Tuculina MJ, Scrieciu M, Stanusi A, Marchini L. "Translation and validation of the ageism scale for dental students in Romanian"... op.cit.

<sup>104</sup> Rupp D.E., Vodanovich S.J., Crede M.. "The multidimensional nature of ageism: construct validity and group differences"... op.cit.

<sup>105</sup> De Biasio JC, Parkas V, Soriano RP. "Longitudinal assessment of medical student attitudes toward older people". *Medical Teacher*. 2016; 38(8):823-828.

than men<sup>106,107</sup>. However, there have been noticed considerable differences between research studies on the impact of gender on ageism levels. Studies conducted with Brazilian dentists<sup>108</sup>, German dental students<sup>109</sup>, U.S. dental students<sup>110</sup> and Iranian dental students<sup>111</sup> found considerably less ageism among women. Notwithstanding, a U.S. study showed high ageism levels among female dental students<sup>112</sup>, while an older U.K study had not found significant differences between male and female dental students<sup>113</sup>. The Greek study conducted by Kossioni et al. resulted in inconclusive findings<sup>114</sup>. The authors state: "Women tended to have more sympathy towards their elderly patients (item Q6), while men believed to a less extent that elderly patients do not usually comply with dental advice (item Q14)." Significant differences between the methodologies used in different studies may give an explanation to the fact that the impact of gender on ageism levels is likely to differ between research studies<sup>115</sup>.

# Age

Age affected the score of the factor 2. The vast majority of participants in our study were younger than 50 years of age due to way by which potential respondents were contacted. Participants aged 56 years and older were found to be less ageist as compared with younger participants. Older participants were found to believe that cost is a barrier that keep elderly patients from seeking dental care. However, this finding might be not conclusive about their ageism because in our opinion this item carries low specific weight of in the context of ageism assessment. The older participants feel closer to the age of elderly people and therefore may be more empathetic towards them. Studies found that younger individuals had considerably higher ageism scores than older individuals<sup>116</sup> <sup>117</sup>. It is relevant to note, moreover, that a Greek study conducted by Kossioni et al. 118 found that age did not affect the total scale score, similar to the U.S. study<sup>119</sup>.

#### Curriculum

As to training in Gerodontology, the items Q7 and Q14 received low ageism scores among dentist who were trained in a full Gerodontology curriculum. This finding is conclusive and indicates that training in Gerodontology is positively correlated with ageism. Among dentists who graduated from the Aristotle University of Thessaloniki, the item Q6 received higher ageism scores while the item Q10 received lower ageism scores compared to those graduated from the Kapodistrian University of Athens. These 'mixed' results do not identify any discernible pattern or trend and look at first blush inconclusive. However, given the truth of our assumption that the item Q10 carries more specific weight in

<sup>106</sup> Hojat M, Gonnella JS, Nasca TJ, Mangione S, Vergare M, Magee M. "Physician empathy: definition, components, measurement, and relationship to gender and specialty". *American Journal of Psychiatry* 2002;159(9):1563-1569.

<sup>107</sup> Málaga G, Gayoso D, Vásquez N. "Empathy in medical students of a private university in Lima, Peru: A descriptive study". *Medwave* 2020; 20(4): e7905.

<sup>108</sup> Moreira AN, Rocha ES, Popoff DA, Vilaça EL, Castilho LS, de Magalhães CS. "Knowledge and attitudes of dentists regarding ageing and the elderly"...op.cit.

<sup>109</sup> Nitschke I, Clarenbach-Tran TH, Schlegel D, Reiber T, Sobotta BA. "Attitudes of German undergraduate dental students towards the aged". *Gerodontology*. 2015; 32(1): 3-12.

<sup>110</sup> Rucker R, Barlow PB, Hartshorn J, Kaufman L, Smith B, Kossioni A, Marchini L. "Dual institution validation of an ageism scale for dental students"...op.cit.

<sup>111</sup> Hatami B, Ahmady AE, Khoshnevisan MH, Lando HA. "Senior dental student's attitudes toward older adults and knowledge of geriatric dental care in the Islamic Republic of Iran". *Eastern Mediterranean Health Journal* 2014;19 Suppl 3:S172-177.

<sup>112</sup> Nochajski TH, Waldrop DP, Davis EL, Fabiano JA, Goldberg LJ. "Factors that influence dental students' attitudes about older adults"...op.cit.

<sup>113</sup> Devlin H, Mellor AC, Worthington HV. "Attitudes of dental students towards elderly people". *Journal of Dentistry* 1994; 22(1): 45-48

<sup>114</sup> Kossioni AE, Ioannidou K, Kalyva D, Marchini L, Hartshorn J, Kaufman L, Smith B, Barlow PB. "Translation and validation of the Greek version of an ageism scale for dental students"...op.cit.

<sup>115</sup> Kossioni AE, Ioannidou K, Kalyva D, Marchini L, Hartshorn J, Kaufman L, Smith B, Barlow PB. "Translation and validation of the Greek version of an ageism scale for dental students"...op.cit.

<sup>116</sup> Rupp D.E., Vodanovich S.J., Crede M.. "The multidimensional nature of ageism: construct validity and group differences"... op.cit.

<sup>117</sup> De Biasio JC, Parkas V, Soriano RP. "Longitudinal assessment of medical student attitudes toward older people"...op.cit.

<sup>118</sup> Kossioni AE, Ioannidou K, Kalyva D, Marchini L, Hartshorn J, Kaufman L, Smith B, Barlow PB. "Translation and validation of the Greek version of an ageism scale for dental students"...op.cit.

<sup>119</sup> Rucker R, Barlow PB, Hartshorn J, Kaufman L, Smith B, Kossioni A, Marchini L. "Dual institution validation of an ageism scale for dental students"...op.cit.

the context of ageism assessment (in sense that indicates more disrespectful behavior towards elderly people) compared to the item Q6, participants graduated from Aristotle University of Thessaloniki might be regarded as showing more positive attitude towards elderly people. While Gerodontology is taught at the University of Athens as a compulsory discipline for approximately 30 years (12 years as a self-reliant lesson, taught by a professor of Gerodontology who moreover teaches Gerodontology in master programs in dentistry), it is taught at the University of Thessaloniki as a compulsory discipline for fourteen years. Furthermore, a discipline that is strictly related to Gerondontology ("Prosthodontic Treatment Within Interdisciplinary Dental Care") is available as an optional subject at the University of Thessaloniki for more than ten years. This may indicate that curriculum is not always the only reason for the differences in ageism between dentists graduated from different universities, e.g. the differences that we found between participants graduated from the University of Athens and participants who graduated from the University of Thessaloniki.

To reduce ageism among dental students it is necessary that their education includes a curriculum in geriatric dentistry<sup>120,121,122,123.</sup> The majority of dental schools all over the world have done it, although with considerable differences in teaching methods<sup>124,125,126</sup>. Importantly, Veenstra et al. recently (2021) argue that further research is needed to determine the content and the methodology of dental training that might reduce age-

ism rates among dental students<sup>127</sup>. Hatami et al. found that "the majority of dental students had low to moderate levels of knowledge of geriatric dental care and attitudes toward elderly people<sup>128</sup>". Dental students should be provided with necessary education that addresses the oral health needs of persons across their lifespan<sup>129</sup>. However, it is arguably suggested that theoretical education (knowledge) alone, without exposure to older patients in clinical settings, cannot always improve attitudes, namely, is not always enough to prevent the high prevalence of ageism among dental students<sup>130</sup> <sup>131</sup>. Kossioni et al. state that greater amount and better type of training than the already offered to dental students of the University of Athens is necessary to improve their attitudes towards elderly patients<sup>132</sup>. Humanities curriculum may lead to ageism decline. Empathy and humanism are essential for dental management of the older population<sup>133,134</sup>. Reducing dental students' ageism should be an important goal of dental education that can be pursued through targeted educational programs. It should be highlighted that there may be potential links between the hidden curriculum and ageism. This may be mediated by empathy given that there may be potential links between the so-called "hidden curriculum" and cynicism135 136.

<sup>120</sup> Hebling E, Mugayar L, Dias PV. "Geriatric dentistry: a new specialty in Brazil"...op.cit.

<sup>121</sup> Pyle MA, Stoller EP. "Oral health disparities among the elderly: interdisciplinary challenges for the future". *Journal of Dental Education* 2003; 67: 1327-1336.

<sup>122</sup> Saintrain MVL, Souza EHA, Caldas Júnior AF. "Geriatric dentistry in Brazilian universities". *Gerodontology* 2006; 23: 231-236

<sup>123</sup> Pietrokovsk J, Zini A. "The Yad Sarah geriatric dental clinic, a different model". *Gerodontology* 2006; 23: 237-241.

<sup>124</sup> Pyle MA, Stoller EP. "Oral health disparities among the elderly: interdisciplinary challenges for the future"...op.cit.

<sup>125</sup> Mohammad AR, Preshaw PM. "Geriatric dentistry education in European dental schools". European Journal of Dental Education 2005; 9: 73-77.

<sup>126</sup> Shah N. "Teaching, learning, and assessment in geriatric dentistry: researching models of practice". *Journal of Dental Education* 2010; 74: 20-28.

<sup>127</sup> Veenstra L, Barlow P, Kossioni A, Popescu SM, Mercut V, Tuculina MJ, Scrieciu M, Stanusi A, Marchini L. "Translation and validation of the ageism scale for dental students in Romanian"... op.cit.

<sup>128</sup> Hatami B, Ahmady AE, Khoshnevisan MH, Lando HA. "Senior dental student's attitudes toward older adults and knowledge of geriatric dental care in the Islamic Republic of Iran"...op.cit.

<sup>129</sup> Wiener RC, Shockey AT, Long DL. "Dental hygiene students' perceptions of older adults"...op.cit.

<sup>130</sup> Moreira AN, Rocha ES, Popoff DA, Vilaça EL, Castilho LS, de Magalhães CS. "Knowledge and attitudes of dentists regarding ageing and the elderly"...op.cit.

<sup>131</sup> Nochajski TH, Waldrop DP, Davis EL, Fabiano JA, Goldberg LJ. "Factors that influence dental students' attitudes about older adults"...op.cit.

<sup>132</sup> Nochajski TH, Waldrop DP, Davis EL, Fabiano JA, Goldberg LJ. "Factors that influence dental students' attitudes about older adults"...op.cit.

<sup>133</sup> MacEntee MI. "The educational challenge of dental geriatrics". Journal of Dental Education. 2010; 74(1): 13-19.

<sup>134</sup> Slack-Smith LM, Hearn L, Wilson DF, Wright F. "Geriatric dentistry, teaching and future directions". *Australian Dental Journal*. 2015; 60(Suppl 1): 125-130.

<sup>135</sup> Neumann M, Edelhäuser F, Tauschel D, Fischer MR, Wirtz M, Woopen C, Haramati A, Scheffer C. "Empathy decline and its reasons: a systematic review of studies with medical students and residents". *Academic Medicine*. 2011; 86(8): 996-1009.

<sup>136</sup> Peng J, Clarkin C, Doja A. "Uncovering cynicism in medical

# Public/private sector

Besides, participants working as a dentist in the public sector were more ageists than those working in the private sector of health care when compared to the Factor 3. Interestingly, participants working in the public sector presented high ageism scores in four items (Q8, Q9, Q11 and Q14).

A possible explanation might be that due to economic crisis in Greece, when elderly people seek diagnosis and treatment for a dental problem, they visit the public healthcare sector rather than the private sector. Dentists working in the public sector may feel overwhelmed with their workload without receiving additional remuneration for this. The factor "Values / ethics of dentists for elderly patients" received higher ageism score among dentists working in the public sector than those working in the private health sector. These results in our opinion are conclusive and indicate high ageism among dentists working in the public healthcare sector.

# Economic status

The higher ageism was found among participants living in towns and villages, as well as among participants in financial difficulties, when compared with the Factor 1. Participants who reported to be financially comfortable were of the opinion that elderly people do take good care of their teeth and that cost is not a barrier that keep elderly patients from seeking dental care. Although these results indicate low ageism among dentists who were better off, in our opinion are not conclusive due to the fact that the abovementioned items do not carry great specific weight in the context of ageism assessment. The same holds for the finding that the factor related to "Adherence of the elderly patient to the instructions of the dentist" had higher score values (more ageism) in participants who stated that were in financial difficulties.

Due to the serious financial crisis in Greece over the past ten years, pensions have noticeably been reduced. As dental care in Greece is mostly not funded by the state or social security out-of-pocket dental expenses

training: a qualitative analysis of medical online discussion forums". *BMJ Open.* 2018; 8(10): e022883.

were difficult to be funded by older persons' lower income. Therefore, items of the scale used in our study that are directly or indirectly related to dental care costs (e.g., "cost is a major barrier to many elderly patients seeking dental care" or "it is normal for elderly people to have oral problems") may not be indicative of ageism<sup>137</sup>. Note, however, that in this connection it is crucial to bear in mind that (as mentioned above, Introduction section) the economic status of the citizens in a country may affect the ageism levels in this country<sup>138,139</sup>.

#### Trust to God

Participants who stated high belief in God found to be opposite to the assumption that elderly people live better in nursing homes (Q4). In our opinion this is conclusive and indicate that trust to God may be positively correlated to low ageism.

As religiosity underlines values such as altruism, sympathy and helping (and caring) for others irrespective of their age, we hypothesized that trust to God might be negatively correlated with ageism levels.

There is not a clear positive correlation between religiosity and ageism in the literature. Empathy might be a mediator between religiosity and ageism. Note, however, that while the research is not yet conclusive, recent data demonstrated an association between religiosity and empathy<sup>140</sup>.

# The role of culture

In the Greek study with dental students conducted by Kossioni et al. the factor "values/ethics about older people" received very low ageism score (Kossioni et al., 2019)<sup>141</sup>. As this factor includes items that are largely

<sup>137</sup> Kossioni AE, Ioannidou K, Kalyva D, Marchini L, Hartshorn J, Kaufman L, Smith B, Barlow PB. "Translation and validation of the Greek version of an ageism scale for dental students"...op.cit.

<sup>138</sup> WHO. Discrimination and negative attitudes about ageing are bad for your health...op.cit.

<sup>139</sup> Jecker NS. "African Conceptions of Age-Based Moral Standing: Anchoring Values to Regional Realities"...op.cit.

<sup>140</sup> Málaga G, Gayoso D, Vásquez N. "Empathy in medical students of a private university in Lima, Peru: A descriptive study"... op.cit.

<sup>141</sup> Kossioni AE, Ioannidou K, Kalyva D, Marchini L, Hartshorn J, Kaufman L, Smith B, Barlow PB. "Translation and validation of the Greek version of an ageism scale for dental students"...op.cit.

related to the cultural context (Q1, Q2 and Q3), it may receive ageism score that is significantly affected by the cultural context<sup>142</sup> (Kossioni et al., 2019).

#### Years of clinical practice

Furthermore, the years of professional (clinical) practice affected the score of the items Q3 and Q7. The more the years of clinical practice, the more the dentists believe that elderly people contribute to the local society and the less they think that they have fixed ideas for treatment. These results seem to be conclusive. The more the years of clinical practice, the less the dentists' ageism. Indeed, the long-lasting career as a dentist goes with a significant clinical experience in treating and interact with elderly patients. This may be an explanation.

Importantly, marital status, employment status and the number of elderly patients per day did not affect not only the total scale score but also none of the items separately. In other words, these factors did not present statistically significant variation in relation to the total scale score or the score of any item. Note, however, that dentists who are parents were found to believe that elderly people contribute a lot to society. Perhaps these participants in reality highlight the role of elderly persons as grandparents. This might be a possible explanation.

#### Strengths and limitations

The study sample consisted of 365 dentists from a variety of areas around the country, namely, it was a nationally representative sample of dentists. The national scope of this study might be regarded as a chief strength of this study. However, although the facebook group used in this study was widespread among the Greek dentists (see Results section), it was not sure that everyone in that population had a known and equal chance of getting selected. That is to say that the sampling was not unquestionably probabilistic. It is noteworthy that while "the use of online surveys has grown rapidly in social science", "non-probability online surveys do not

replace probability surveys143". Self-selection bias cannot be excluded. Therefore, the generalizability of the findings cannot be completely ensured. Moreover, our study sample was somewhat biased towards dentists younger than 50 years of age. In majority, dentists were under 45 years old. Only 9.86% of the participants were older than 56 years. Provided that we explored ageism, the participants' age might have affected the results of the study. This might be regarded as a limitation of the study. Even if the findings of this study are generalizable and the Greek ageism scale for dental students (ASDS\_Gr) is not applicable for professionals (dentists), the three factors that met a sufficient Cronbach's alpha value can be a first step in developing an ageism scale for dentists. This can be considered as a strength of this study, given that there is still no convergent validity between scales developed for assessing ageism in the field of dentistry<sup>144</sup>.

#### 7. Conclusions

The present on-line survey revealed that the Greek version of the ageism scale for dental students had not further validity and reliability as a measure for assessing dentists' attitudes towards elderly patients. A reliable total ageism score was not identified. However, three factors were identified, which achieved high reliability towards validity. This finding can indicate ageism trends among dentists in Greece. The identified factors may be of great importance for the ongoing research on measuring ageism in dental healthcare. Irrespective of whether or not the findings of this study are generalizable to the dentist population in Greece, the robust reliability of the three factors that have been identified in this study deserve further attention at the prospect of developing a universally accepted (tested in diverse populations) ageism scale that covers all dimensions of ageism. Furthermore, a demographic comparison was conducted in this study.

<sup>142</sup> Kossioni AE, Ioannidou K, Kalyva D, Marchini L, Hartshorn J, Kaufman L, Smith B, Barlow PB. "Translation and validation of the Greek version of an ageism scale for dental students"...op.cit.

<sup>143</sup> Lehdonvirta, V., Oksanen, A., Räsänen, P., Blank, G.. "Social Media, Web, and Panel Surveys: Using Non-Probability Samples in Social and Policy Research". *Policy & internet*, 2021; 13: 134-155.

<sup>144</sup> Sophie P, Valerie RL, Guillaume V. Specific form of ageism in dental care: Convergent validity of the Ageism Scale for Dental Students and its implications for education. Eur J Dent Educ. 2022 May 11. doi: 10.1111/eje.12817. Epub ahead of print. PMID: 35543310.

In general, our survey did not provide conclusive results, indicating a clear trend in ageism among dentists in Greece. While the participants do not tend to pay more attention and sympathy toward their elderly patients and believe that cost is a major barrier to many elderly patients seeking dental care, they believe that elderly patients are not better off in nursing homes and they deserve to invest time, effort and money in complex and expensive dental treatment.

The findings of this survey appear to endorse a suggestion that there is a research gap in the hot topic of ageism in dental practice. Therefore, we endorse the suggestion that the development of a universally accepted (tested in diverse populations) ageism scale that covers all dimensions of ageism is desirable. Importantly, the three factors that met a sufficient Cronbach's alpha value can be a first step in developing of a universally accepted (tested in diverse populations) ageism scale that covers all dimensions of ageism, which is desirable.

In addition, we suggest that not only quantitative but also qualitative studies should be used to explore the complex topic of ageism among dentists. The sole quantifying of ageism cannot capture adequately the phenomenon.

The comparison of the demographics with each single item have provided statistically significant trends in ageism for many demographics. However, the demographic comparison yielded mixed (inconclusive) results vis-à-vis certain demographic factors, with some items receiving low ageism scores and some receiving high ageism scores.

# Availability of data and materials

The authors declare that the data analyzed during the current study and supporting the findings of this study are available from the corresponding author on reasonable request.

#### **Abbreviations**

ASDS\_Gr = Greek ageism scale for dental students WHO = World Health Organization

# Funding source

There are no sources of funding to be declared.

# Acknowledgements

The authors are grateful to the participants of this study for their collaboration.

#### Conflicts of interest

The authors declare that they have no competing interests.

#### References

- Abe S, Ishihara K, Adachi M, Okuda K. "Tongue-coating as risk indicator for aspiration pneumonia in edentate elderly". *Archives of Gerontology and Geriatrics*. 2008; 47: 267-275.
- Awano S, Ansai T, Takata Y, et al. "Oral health and mortality risk from pneumonia in the elderly". *Journal of Dental Research*. 2008; 87: 334-339.
- Ayalon L, Dolberg P, Mikulionienė S, et al. "A systematic review of existing ageism scales". *Ageing Research Reviews*. 2019; 54:100919.
- Beck JD, Ettinger RL, Glenn RE, Paule CL, Holtzman JM. "Oral health status: impact on dental student attitudes toward the aged". *Gerontologist* 1979; 19: 580-584.
- Bowling A. "Ageism in cardiology". *British Medical Journal*. 1999; 319: 1353-1355.
- Brocklehurst P, Macey R. "Skill-mix in preventive dental practice-will it help address need in the future?" BMC Oral Health. 2015; 15(Suppl 1): \$10.
- Butler RN. Age-Ism. "Another form of bigotry". *Gerontologist*. 1969; 9: 243-246.
- Chang ES, Kannoth S, Levy S, Wang SY, Lee JE, Levy BR. "Global reach of ageism on older persons' health: A systematic review". *PLoS One*. 2020;15(1): e0220857.
- Cunha Junior APC, Santos MBF, Santos JFF, Marchini L. "Dentists' perceptions and barriers to provide oral care for dependent elderly at home, long-term care institutions or hospitals". *Brazilian Journal of Oral Sciences* 2018; 17: e18223.

- De Biasio JC, Parkas V, Soriano RP. "Longitudinal assessment of medical student attitudes toward older people". *Medical Teacher*. 2016; 38(8):823-828.
- De Lugt-Lustig KH, Vanobbergen JN, van der Putten GJ, De Visschere LM, Schols JM, de Baat C. "Effect of oral healthcare education on knowledge, attitude and skills of care home nurses: a systematic literature review". Community Dentistry and Oral Epidemiology. 2014; 42: 88-96.
- De Visschere L, de Baat C, Schols JM, Deschepper E, Vanobbergen J. "Evaluation of the implementation of an 'oral hygiene protocol' in nursing homes: a 5-year longitudinal study". *Community Dentistry and Oral Epidemiology*. 2011; 39: 416-425.
- De Visschere L, Van Der Putten GJ, de Baat C, Schols J, Vanobbergen J. "The impact of undergraduate geriatric dental education on the attitudes of recently graduated dentists towards institutionalised elderly people". European Journal of Dental Education. 2009; 13(3): 154-161.
- Devlin H, Mellor AC, Worthington HV. "Attitudes of dental students towards elderly people". *Journal of Dentistry* 1994; 22(1): 45-48.
- Ettinger RL, Beck JD, Martin WE. "Treatment planning for an older adult: a pilot study". *The Iowa dental journal*. 1989; 75: 31-34.
- Ettinger RL. "A 30-year review of a geriatric dentistry teaching programme". *Gerodontology*. 2012; 29(2): e1252-e1260.
- Fabiano JA, Waldrop DP, Nochajski TH, Davis EL, Goldberg LJ. "Understanding dental students' knowledge and perceptions of older people: toward a new model of geriatric dental education". *Journal of Dental Education*. 2005; 69(4):419-33.
- Fiske J. "The delivery of oral care services to elderly people living in a noninstitutionalized setting".

  Journal of Public Health Dentistry. 2000; 60: 321-325.
- Forsell M, Sjögren P, Kullberg E, et al. "Attitudes and perceptions towards oral hygiene tasks among geriatric nursing home staff". *International Journal of Dental Hygiene*. 2011; 9(3): 199-203.

- Ghoneim A, Yu B, Lawrence H, Glogauer M, Shankardass K, Quiñonez C. "What influences the clinical decision-making of dentists? A cross-sectional study". *PLoS One*. 2020;15(6): e0233652.
- Gilbert GH. "Ageism' in dental care delivery". The Journal of the American Dental Association. 1989;118(5):545-548.
- Gordon SR, Sullivan TM. "Dental treatment planning for compromised or elderly patients". *Gerodontics*. 1986;2: 217-222.
- Grandjean ML, Morier C, Piccardi C, Srinivasan M. "Survey on the attitudes of dental hygiene students towards treating elderly patients". *International Journal of Dental Hygiene* 2021; 19(2): 176-183.
- Harbison LA, Gurenlian JR, Freudenthal J, Moffit D. "Direct access dental hygienists' perceptions concerning geriatric curriculum in entry-level dental hygiene programs". *Journal of Dental Hygiene*. 2020; 94(5): 22-29.
- Hatami B, Ahmady AE, Khoshnevisan MH, Lando HA. "Senior dental student's attitudes toward older adults and knowledge of geriatric dental care in the Islamic Republic of Iran". *Eastern Mediterranean Health Journal*. 2014;19 Suppl 3: S172-177.
- Hebling E, Mugayar L, Dias PV. "Geriatric dentistry: a new specialty in Brazil". *Gerodontology.* 2007; 24: 177-180.
- Hojat M, Gonnella JS, Nasca TJ, Mangione S, Vergare M, Magee M. "Physician empathy: definition, components, measurement, and relationship to gender and specialty". American Journal of Psychiatry. 2002;159(9):1563-1569.
- Inglehart R, Haerpfer C, Moreno A, Welzel C, Kizilova K, Diez-Medrano J, Lagos M, Norris P, Ponarin E, Puranen B, et al. (eds.). [Publicación en línea]. 2014. World Values Survey: Round Six Country-Pooled Datafile Version: www.worldvaluessurvey.org/WVSDocumentationWV6.jsp. Madrid: JD Systems Institute. (Consulted 23/8/2022).
- Jecker NS. "African Conceptions of Age-Based Moral Standing: Anchoring Values to Regional Realities". Hastings Center Report. 2020; 50(2):35-43.

- Kandelman D, Petersen PE, Ueda H. "Oral health, general health, and quality of life in older people". *Special Care in Dentistry*. 2008; 28: 224-236.
- Kossioni AE, Ioannidou K, Kalyva D, Marchini L, Hartshorn J, Kaufman L, Smith B, Barlow PB. "Translation and validation of the Greek version of an ageism scale for dental students". *Gerodontology*. 2019; 36(3):251-257.
- Lehdonvirta V, Oksanen A, Räsänen P, Blank G. "Social Media, Web, and Panel Surveys: Using Non-Probability Samples in Social and Policy Research". *Policy & internet* 2021; 13: 134-155.
- Lovell M. "Caring for the elderly: changing perceptions and attitudes". *Journal of Vascular Nursing*. 2006; 24: 22-26.
- MacEntee MI, Pruksapong M, Wyatt CLL "Insights from students following an educational rotation through Dental Geriatrics". *Journal of Dental Education*. 2005; 69: 1368-1376.
- MacEntee MI. "The educational challenge of dental geriatrics". *Journal of Dental Education*. 2010; 74(1): 13-19.
- Málaga G, Gayoso D, Vásquez N. "Empathy in medical students of a private university in Lima, Peru: A descriptive study". *Medwave*. 2020; 20(4): e7905.
- Marchini L, Ettinger R, Chen X, et al. "Geriatric dentistry education and context in a selection of countries in 5 continents". *Special Care in Dentistry*. 2018; 38(3): 123-132.
- Marques S, Mariano J, Mendonça J, De Tavernier W, Hess M, Naegele L, Peixeiro F, Martins D. "Determinants of Ageism against Older Adults: A Systematic Review". International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health. 2020; 17(7):2560.
- Masse M, Meire P. "L'âgisme, un concept pertinent pour penser les pratiques de soins aux personnes âgées ? [Is ageism a relevant concept for health care practice in the elderly?]". Gériatrie et Psychologie Neuropsychiatrie du Vieillissement. 2012; 10(3):333-341. [in French].
- Miegel K, Wachtel T. "Improving the oral health of older people in long-term residential care: a review of

- the literature". *International Journal of Older People Nursing*. 2009; 4: 97-113.
- Mohammad AR, Preshaw PM. "Geriatric dentistry education in European dental schools". *European Journal of Dental Education*. 2005; 9: 73-77.
- Moreira AN, Rocha ES, Popoff DA, Vilaça EL, Castilho LS, de Magalhães CS. "Knowledge and attitudes of dentists regarding ageing and the elderly". *Gerodontology*. 2012; 29(2): e624-e631.
- Müller F. "Oral hygiene reduces the mortality from aspiration pneumonia in frail elders". *Journal of Dental Research*. 2015; 94: 14S-16S.
- Neumann M, Edelhäuser F, Tauschel D, Fischer MR, Wirtz M, Woopen C, Haramati A, Scheffer C. "Empathy decline and its reasons: a systematic review of studies with medical students and residents". *Academic Medicine*. 2011; 86(8): 996-1009.
- Newton JP. "The benefits of education for the elderly and about the elderly". *Gerodontology*. 2006; 23: 129-130.
- Nicol R, Petrina Sweeney M, McHugh S, Bagg J. "Effectiveness of health care worker training on the oral health of elderly residents of nursing homes". *Community Dentistry and Oral Epidemiology*. 2005; 33(2): 115-124.
- Nitschke I, Clarenbach-Tran TH, Schlegel D, Reiber T, Sobotta BA. "Attitudes of German undergraduate dental students towards the aged". *Gerodontology*. 2015; 32(1): 3-12.
- Nochajski TH, Davis EL, Waldrop DP, Fabiano JA, Goldberg LJ. "Dental students' attitudes about older adults: do type and amount of contact make a difference?". Journal of Dental Education. 2011;75(10):1329-1332.
- Nochajski TH, Waldrop DP, Davis EL, Fabiano JA, Goldberg LJ. "Factors that influence dental students' attitudes about older adults". *Journal of Dental Education*. 2009;73(1):95-104.
- Officer A, Schneiders ML, Wu D, Nash P, Thiyagarajan JA, Beard JR. "Valuing older people: time for a global campaign to combat ageism". *Bulletin of the World Health Organization*. 2016; 94(10): 710-710A.
- Peng J, Clarkin C, Doja A. "Uncovering cynicism in medical training: a qualitative analysis of medical online discussion forums". *BMJ Open*. 2018; 8(10): e022883.

- Pietrokovsk J, Zini A. "The Yad Sarah geriatric dental clinic, a different model". *Gerodontology* 2006; 23: 237-241.
- Pyle MA, Stoller EP. "Oral health disparities among the elderly: interdisciplinary challenges for the future". Journal of Dental Education. 2003; 67: 1327-1336.
- Quagliarello V, Ginter S, Han L, Van Ness P, Allore H, Tinetti M. "Modifiable risk factors for nursing home-acquired pneumonia". *Clinical Infectious Diseases*. 2005; 40: 1-6.
- Robb C, Cjhen H, Haley WE. "Ageism in mental health and health care: a critical review". *Journal of Clinical Geropsychology*. 2002; 8: 1-12.
- Royal College of Physicians. [Publicación en linea] "Hospitals on the edge? The time for action." London, 2012. https://www.rcplondon.ac.uk/guidelines-policy/hospitals-edge-time-action (Consulted 23/8/2022).
- Rucker R, Barlow PB, Bertolini Fernandes Dos Santos M, Carrera Malhao E, Kossioni A, Marchini L. "Translation and preliminary validation of an ageism scale for dental students in Brazil". *Gerodontology*. 2020; 37(1):87-92
- Rucker R, Barlow PB, Hartshorn J, Kaufman L, Smith B, Kossioni A, Marchini L. "Development and preliminary validation of an ageism scale for dental students". *Special Care in Dentistry*. 2018; 38(1): 31-35.
- Rucker R, Barlow PB, Hartshorn J, Kaufman L, Smith B, Kossioni A, Marchini L. "Dual institution validation of an ageism scale for dental students". Special Care in Dentistry. 2019; 39(1): 28-33.
- Rupp D.E., Vodanovich S.J., Crede M.. "The multidimensional nature of ageism: construct validity and group differences". The Journal of Social Psychology. 2005; 145: 335-362.
- Saintrain MVL, Souza EHA, Caldas Júnior AF. "Geriatric dentistry in Brazilian universities". *Gerodontology.* 2006; 23: 231-236.
- Schmidt J, Holas M, Halvorson K, Reding M. "Videofluoroscopic evidence of aspiration predicts pneumonia and death but not dehydration following stroke". *Dysphagia*. 1994; 9: 7-11.

- Shah N. "Teaching, learning, and assessment in geriatric dentistry: researching models of practice". *Journal of Dental Education*. 2010; 74: 20-28.
- Silva MES, Magalhães CS, Ferreira EF. "Complete removable prostheses: from expectation to (dis)satisfaction". *Gerodontology.* 2009; 26: 143-149.
- Slack-Smith LM, Hearn L, Wilson DF, Wright F. "Geriatric dentistry, teaching and future directions". *Australian Dental Journal*. 2015; 60(Suppl 1): 125-130.
- Sophie P, Valerie RL, Guillaume V. "Specific form of ageism in dental care: Convergent validity of the Ageism Scale for Dental Students and its implications for education." *Eur J Dent Educ*. 2022 May 11. doi: 10.1111/eje.12817. Epub ahead of print. PMID: 35543310.
- Special Committee on Aging United States Senate. [Publicación en línea] "Ageism in healthcare: are our nation's seniors receiving proper oral health care?". 2003. https://www.govinfo.gov/content/pkg/CHRG-108shrg91118/html/CHRG-108shrg91118.htm (Consulted: 23/8/2022).
- Swift H.J., Abrams D., Marques S., Vauclair CM., Bratt C., Lima ML. "Ageism in the European Region: Finding from the European Social Survey". In: Ayalon L., Tesch-Römer C. (eds) Contemporary Perspectives on Ageism. Springer, 2018, vol 19, 441-459.
- Szabo KB, Boyd LD, LaSpina LM. "Educational preparedness to provide care for older adults in alternative practice settings: perceptions of dental hygiene practitioners". *Journal of Dental Hygiene*. 2018; 92: 16-23.
- Veenstra L, Barlow P, Kossioni A, Popescu SM, Mercut V, Tuculina MJ, Scrieciu M, Stanusi A, Marchini L. "Translation and validation of the ageism scale for dental students in Romanian". *European Journal of Dental Education*. 2021; 25(1):12-17.
- Vujicic M. The "de-aging" of the dentist workforce. *JADA* 2016; 147(10): 843-845.
- Waldrop DP, Fabiano JA, Nochajski TH, Zittel-Palamara KM, Davis EL, Goldberg LJ. "More than a set of teeth: assessing and enhancing dental students' perceptions of older adults". *Gerontoogy and Geriatrics Education*. 2006; 27(1):37-56.

- WHO. [Publicación en línea]. "Discrimination and negative attitudes about ageing are bad for your health".
  2016. https://www.who.int/news-room/detail/29-09-2016-discrimination-and-negative-attitudes-about-ageing-are-bad-for-your-health (Consulted 23/8/2022).
- WHO. "World Report on Ageing and Health". Geneva, Switzerland: World Health Organization; 2015.
- Wiener RC, Shockey AT, Long DL. "Dental hygiene students' perceptions of older adults". *Journal of Dental Education*. 2014; 78(12): 1623-1628.
- Wyman MF, Shiovitz-Ezra S, Bengel J. "Ageism in the Health Care System: Providers, Patients, and Systems". *Contemporary Perspectives on Ageism*. 2018; 193-212.